Александар Атанасовски

Молкот на жените во Византија помеѓу каноните и реалноста

Abstract: The subject of our research is the silence of women in the Middle ages, with special emphasis of the silence of women in Byzantium, or more precisely – how in reality canonical provisions were respected by women and about provisions that women should remain silent in church at the front of man?

To be born as a man or women in any society is not just a simple biological fact. It is a biological fact that has social implications. Women constitute a special social group, and the character of that group, which historians have long ignored, has nothing in common with women's "nature". The problem lies in the nature of society and perception of women, so legal and historical sources speak about that from a special aspect – from a male worldview. Man had legal independence and the right to speak in public, but women were either prohibited or allowed with disapproval. Men possessed the power, and according to that, our sources mainly talk about them. It is particularly difficult to glance beneath the surface of the Middle Ages in order to realize the life of more modest members of the society. Therefore, our attention is focused to information about women from royal families, empresses; how much the provisions for silence were applicable for them and how some of them were engaged in discussions about certain religious issues, and their opinions led to important decisions which had a significant effect to the events in Byzantium. All of Byzantines which kept the data about their civilization (historians, lawyers or hagiographical compilers) were men and their writings are devoted to activities of their male fellows; that fact which make difficulties to our research, so we will refer to the provisions of the Byzantine legislation.

Key words: women; laws; canons; empresses; religious debates; silence

It is known that Byzantium was the first country where Christianity was recognized as an egalitarian religion in 313 with the so-called Edict of Milan, and later as a state religion. Byzantium was the first state where Christian worldview and Christian model of living was built, complained with Christian norms and canons.

Precisely based on the Christian model the relationships were built between genders, relations man-women and this model defined the role of women in society. Byzantium itself accepted this model in all countries that have accepted the Christianity and then developed that model according to their traditions and needs.

Christian learning had an influence on the formation of the basic representations of women, and according to that about when, where and how women should talk.

88 BALKANISTIC FORUM Vol. 2/2015

As regards to the words and silence of women, recognized authority was St. Paul, who considered women inferior to the men and forbade them to teach (Tim. 1.2:12) and to publicly address in the councils, but allowing them, if they would like to get some specific information, they should ask their own husbands at home (Cor. 1.14:34-35). In his Epistle to the Corinthians, the Apostle Paul says: "your women should remain silent in the church; they are not allowed to speak, but must be subdued, as the Law says (Tit. 2, 5; 1. Tim. 2, 12; Cor. 3, 18; Eph. 5, 22; 1 Mos. 3, 16)¹. In further he adds: "If they want to inquire about something, they should ask their own husbands at home; for it is disgraceful for a woman to speak in the church"². These biblical passages, which for centuries have been commented by many scholars, were the cornerstones of the guardianship that was recommended by preachers and moralists. The first assignment was to expel the words of women from the public forum in privacy. Canon Law states that women are ineligible for tutoring and preaching.

How the Canon Law was implemented in the reality in Byzantium, and whether women were really silent, we will try to show some examples from the everyday life, the life in which women have an active role.

At the very beginning we have to emphasize that the Byzantine Civil Law reflected in the Code (Laws) of Justinian I, Leo III, Basil I and Leo VI the Wise give a right to a women and girls to inherit property from their husbands and fathers, to lead their workplaces, to have trade enterprises, to lead the family, to teach children, and so on. All of this, women were unable to perform in silence. On the other side, women can become independent after her husband died and she would remain widow, and in that case she lead the inherited property; if she was a women of the emperor she could lead the state as a regent of the minors sons, and in that case she had a right to freely emphasizes her thoughts and ideas, even to convening and managing the religious and Ecumenical councils.

From the many examples in Byzantium, we will focus on several important women about the fate of the state.

Normally, we start with St. Helena, mother of the first Christian ruler of the Byzantine - Constantine I the Great. Helena, according to the tradition, discovered Holy Cross. Here we meet the nocturnal motives. Helena had a dream that the cross is located in Jerusalem under some temple of demons. Then the queen went to Jerusalem and immediately God showed the place to bishop, where the temple and statue of demons was raised. Then the queen had used her authority, she gathered many masters and workers and order - the temple has to destroy to its foundations. When it was finished, God's grave appeared, and not far from there three crosses has been bury in the ground when carefully searched the surrounding area, they found nail. Empress was sad, because she did not know what was the cross on which Jesus was crucified. Bishop with faith answered her dilemma. When the shadow of Salvation Cross touched the some sick women, at the same moment she got out of bed and glorified God. The Empress then with a great joy and fear has raised the cross and the part with nails brought to his son, and then made silver civorius and with the rest of the cross she handed to the bishop of the city to be remembered to all generation. She ordered to build a church in Holy Golgotha, in Bethlehem, where God receive birth by body and on Mount of Olives, where God blessed his disciples and then ascended to the heaven. Since she made many good deeds, she returned to her son ³.

From the above, we can clearly see that St. Helena ordered a crush of the temple, and ordered church to be build, which means that she has not been silent, but commanded the masters, which were mostly men and they listen her commandments.

The second example is related to Ariadne, a widow of Emperor Zeno. After the death of Zeno, on the evening of 9 April 491, at the gates of the great hall in the palace, senior officials, the Patriarch, and the members of the Senate were gathered. At the same time the people were gathered at the Hippodrome, initially divided into parties, they took their places. They were surrounded by the military, parts of the guard, also prepared to take part in the election of the new emperor. Upon the request of the audience, Ariadne was welcomed with shouts: "Ariadne Augusta, Victory is yours!" "Orthodox emperor for the Universe!"⁴. Queen addressed the audience with a speech, in which she announced that she already *gave the necessary orders* to the Senate and to the representatives of the military. They were told to seek for a Christian emperor, born as Roman (Roman by birth), a virtuous and devotional man.

Then when the noise was reduced, the messenger of the Empress confirmed that the Empress would like all wishes and requests to delay for a while, and all participants have need to think only about the good of the state. At the end, Ariadne asked to not hurry with the election and to give a possibility for dignified and devotional funeral of the previous emperor. Again, from the people the shouts were heard: "Order and devotion in the city!", "Long live Empress!", "The Empire is yours, Ariadne, victory is yours!"

Queen returned to her home, and other officials and the patriarch were unable to come to a common solution regarding the candidate. Then Urbicus suggested a simple way out – to leave a choice to the queen. After briefly thinking, Ariadne has uttered the name of Senator Anastasius, who was rapidly brought to the palace and entered in the hall of consistorium. The next day the funeral of Zeno wad performed. Two days after the death of Zeno, at 11 April 491 (Good Friday) all officials and Patriarch Euthymius have gathered dressed in white robes, welcoming all attendees where among all, Anastasius had come⁵. The officials and members of the Senate asked him to take his oath that he will rule by the honor and will not make any ills against anyone, and he gave the oath. Anastasius dressed in imperial clothes was welcomed by the army and raised on a shield. At the front of attendees, Anastasius held a speech, and noted: "It is clear that human power depends from a will of the Above. The merciful Augusta Ariadne by her own decision, elected officials and the Senate, and according to the military and "holy" people, I was forced against the will to accept the care of the Roman Empire. God will be with you!"⁶

The next example is related to Theodora – wife of Justinian I. Unlike the first two women who were widows, and perhaps that position let them a right to speak and present their own opinions, Theodora was married to Justinian even that she had low origin. Because of the great Justinian's love toward Theodora, Emperor Justin withdrew the law that forbade marriage between highly positioned persons (officials, aristocrats, senators, etc.) with actresses, dancers, with the people from

90

the lower social groups, and on that way to satisfy his nephew Justinian, and allowed to marry Theodora⁷.

In 523, the wedding took place, and after it, Theodora received the title of Patricia.

Theodora was born politician and wonderfully understood the problems of the state governance. All writers of chronicles unanimously claim that Theodora was the first associate and friend of the emperor in the state affairs and that she has authority almost as he had. All her secrets she shared with her husband. She herself used to say, "The emperor has not decided anything without her advice and she herself", and Justinian himself writes that: "counseling in that case once again with our holy and devout wife, whom God gave out to us, we decided..."⁸ If that speech of the emperor happened to be contrary the opinion of the Empress, often the will of the woman wins.

During the visit, guests also fall at her feet and kissed her shoes. Without any objection, she was considered as a figure equal to the emperor. Officials and military leaders, soldiers swore: "in Almighty God, His only-born Son, our Lord Jesus Christ, and the Holy Spirit, the holy and glorious Virgin Mary, the four Gospels, the Holy Archangels Michael and Gabriel, I swear that I will serve well to the devout and bright lords Justinian and Theodora, the wife of his imperial majesty..."⁹.

Empress became "female leader"; every woman could address and complained to her husband or to seek for help.

Her decisiveness came to the fore during the uprising "Nika" in Constantinople, when all Justinian's conunselors convinced to leave the capital city, then Theodora gave a talk in front of all of them and pointed: "I think, that the present moment at least allows us to judge that a woman should not stand out of front of men or ostente, when they are reluctant to act so or otherwise. Those who are in danger should regulate the current things as well as could be. I think that an escape as never, and now, even if it brings an resque, is inconvenient for us. Everyone who came in the wide world could die, and the one who once became an emperor can not lived in persecution. I could not live without this red silken robe, nor would have remained alive in the day when passersby would not call me a queen. If Emperor, you want to escape, it will cost you nothing. We have the money, and the sea and vessels, but be careful and not prefer to die - rather than to be saved. I like an old proverb which says: "Tthe best mortuary shroud - is imperial purple tipped"¹⁰.

This Theodora's presentation delighted attendees and nobody thought about escape.

Another remarkable example is the Empress Irene. She was born in 752 in Athens, originated from a poor family, but was very beautiful.¹¹. Irene was decisive and daring woman. Fearing not to loss her authority, after the death of her husband, she made an affort and not practiced any extramartial relationships, surrounded by a larger circle of eunuchs. Although she was crowned Empress, she naturally thought that the official power of the Roman Empire belongs to her underage son, as a men, and the name of Constantine VI was in the public documents before the name of the mother¹².

Irene belonged to those powerful figures, which were able to despise the time, to change the course of historical events, not fearing to bear the responsibility for their actions.

In May 784 discussions about icons already kindled. Irene was advised by Tarasius, her personal secretary and assess that she need to take the opportunity and convene an Ecumenical Council, because without it any restoration of veneration of the icons would be impossible. Together with her secretary, they designed combination, in order to prepare social reaction towards establishing the veneration of icons¹³.

Empress had convened The Sinklit (Senate), where she proposed Patriarch of Constantinople to designate Tarasius (784-806), who at first not accept but then in deal with Irene, he accepted. Tarasius was a secular person and as layman was not obligated to accept the provisions of the Council of 754. Empress at the front of gathered people said the following: "You brothers know what Patriarch Pavle made, if he was alive, the we would not let him to leave the patriarchal throne, although he received the monastic oath. But if, as it is pleasing to God, then we should thing about the man who could refer us to govern the Church of God with letters of instruction!"¹⁴ In his defense secretary told them that the Empress herself will receive the call only if convene the Ecumenical Council. On December 26 784, Tarasius became the Patriarch of Constantinople¹⁵, and then made appropriate invitations for the Council and send them to other Eastern patriarchs¹⁶.

Empress addressed this situation to the Pope, mentioning his duty to determine and establish the traditions regading the respectation of the icons. She begged the Pope to come personally to the Council, or at least to send his legacies. The Pope sent two of his legacies to the Council¹⁷.

August had been determined as a start of the Council in Constantinople. August 17th was the day when first sessions began and the first acts were enacted. But there was a rebellion of the army, soldiers entered and closed the Council¹⁸.

Irene found a way to get out of this situation. She sent armies in the East with an excuse – because of attack from Arabs. At the same time border troops arrived in Constantinople which were loyal to the Empress. After one year, the Empress published a proclamation calling once again the Ecumenical Council to be convened, but this in Nicaea. The first part had 8 sessions and was held on September 24 787 at the Temple of St. Sophia in Nicaea¹⁹. The Council was successfully finished, and about decisions, Pope Adrian sent a letter. The letter begins: "devotional lords and emperors, beloved by God and our Lord Jesus Christ, children, I bless the rule of Constantine and Irene"²⁰.

In 782 Irene sent the request to Charles the Great in order to engage his daughter Rotruda with Emperor Constantine. Negotiations with Charles the Greatwere suspended by Irene in 788²¹.

As against the measure, in the year 794 Charles the Great had convened Council of Frankfurt and promotes his idea to become "Roman Emperor". At the Council Charles said that: women has never ruled with imperial status, even more, has not chaired the episcopal councils! "Inability of females and volatility of the spirit, as it is said in canonical explanations, the pretensions of Charles, do not allow women to come forward with the authority of teachers, they have tends to be led by

men. In Holy books we read that the women was given to man for reproduction of the genus, for help, but was not told that she was appointed for teaching"²². Charles the Great declared Irene and Constantine as heretics and forced Pope Adrian to anathematize VII Ecumenical Council. On 25th of December 800, on the Christmas Pope Leo III crowed Charles the Great for an emperor²³, and already in the autumn of 802 in Constantinople arrived the legacy of Charles the Great with marriage proposal with Irene²⁴, but the idea has not been realized²⁵.

Irene forced the soldiers to give oath: "We will not recognize, Empress, your son as long as you are alive"²⁶.

On July 15, the 797 Constantine VI was arrested by order of his mother and blinded ²⁷. Since then, Irina independently manage the empire. She ordered on coins to be labeled: "Irene, the Great Roman Basileus - autokrator"²⁸.

Another example when women manage on behalf of her son is the mother of Michael III – Empress Theodora. Theodora was Armenian, born in Paphlagonia. She was beautiful women, and had good relation with her husband. Empress had a great influence to her husband. After the birth of fourth daughter Theophilus ordered to "coined gold coin". On the one side of the coin the oldest ones Theodora and Thecla were presented, on the other – daughters Anastasia and Anna²⁹. The Byzantine practice of presenting the female members of royal family had been very rare, and on that basis we can judge and see how the relationships developed in the family of Theodora³⁰.

Empress had a great influence to her husband. Emperor respected his wife's parents. Mother Theotiste was raised to the rank of patricia and had "the right to a free vote"³¹.

After the death of Theophilus, as her guards, appointed by Theophilus were: first minister of the palace – the eunuch Theoctistus, brother of Empress Ward and uncle of Theodora – magistrate Manual, all Armenians³².

Monks approached Theodora and asked to protect the Orhodoxy, and she replied that long ago had a dreams only about it, but many officials and bishops hamper her. Then protectors (tutors) emphasized the thought that she, as fully fledged Augusta may decide: "Only you, lady, have commendable reasoning and thinking, what prevents you to bring it into compliance and to make this popular victory"³³. Then Theodora through droungarios sent an ultimatum to the Patriarch John Grammaticus, to retreat from service and revive the monks. He was replaced by Methodius (843-847) who was supporter of Orthodoxy.

In spring 843 Empress convened the Council in Constantinople, and ceremoniously announced the final victory over the heresy. On the day of the Council meeting empress along with her son and the Sinklit, with candles in hands have entered into temple, tsars accessed to the Patriarch and together approached the altar, and hence to the royal ports. At the meeting empress had a fiery speech. At the end she said: "Fathers and clergy of God! With great inclination I donate to you the restoration of the holy icons!". Then in the first week of the Great Lent, 11 March 843, the Fathers of the Council together with empress held an entire night of singing in the church St. Sofia and ceremoniously announced the establishment of the veneration of the icons³⁴.

During the election of new patriarch, Ignatius on 11 July 847 the main word was the one of Empress Theodora³⁵.

Somewhere at the end of the reign of Theodora historical sources give us information about another important women, which was not from the royal family, but was very rich and supporter of the next Byzantine Emperor Basil I. It was the widow Danilida, which lived in the Peloponnese³⁶. When she heard about the capabilities of Basil and predictions about him, she wished to meet him. During a stay of Basil together with Emperor Michael III in the Peloponnese, Basil retains in the city of Patras and there he met Danilida and they became close friends. When Basil wanted to return to Constantinople, Danilida asked to sign a spiritual fraternity with her son John, and in return she gave him 30 slaves, a lot of money and gave to a Macedonian, a large land in possession. So Basil entered in the circle of rich people in Byzantium, which enable him, material insurance for his mother and sisters³⁷.

Later, when Basil became emperor, Danilida came to Constantinople and during the meeting with emperor she gave him 500 slaves, eunuchs, comprehensive workplaces in the Peloponnese and many other expensive gifts. She was awarded with the title of "royal mother", and after that Danilida returned to her property³⁸.

That women lived long and when she realized that life is coming to an end, she once again turned to the capital and with her eyes to see the emperor's successor, his son Leo, to whom left all of her estate, her son John was dead. Is enough to say that besides of gold and 3000 donated slaves, Danilida gave to emperor 80 factories in his personal possession³⁹. Meeting of Basil and Danilida changed the life of Basil, and her actions suggest that she decided by her own will about her wealth and has a properties as she wanted.

During the rule of the Macedonian dynasty, political role of Theophane – wife of Roman II has been noted. Roman II became emperor after the death of his father Constantine VII (6 November 959)⁴⁰. Along with Roman II came his 18 years old wife Theophane to the throne, and she shared the title Augusta with her mother in law Helena. Firstly, Roman was married to Bertha, daughter of Hugo, but she died. Then, Roman II married Anastasia, and she took the name Theophane. That woman is not less significant than Theodora. Theophane defeated all previous ones with her beauty. Her origins were unknown, believed that she was daughter of innworker, born in Lacedemonia, who held the inn in the poor district of Constantinople.

Roman met her before their marriage and love evolved between them. Father of Roman did not want to oppose the feelings of his son and future daughter in law knew how to dazzle with her beauty the Emperor and Empress Helena⁴¹. In 958, she gave birth to son Basil, and in 960 she gave birth to the second son Constantine. Then gave birth to two daughters⁴².

The authority of the emperors of the Macedonian dynasty was so high that no one was allowed to oppose this unequal marriage, although the new queen was not liked by people. It grew to open eagerly and Empress was associated with many misdeeds. People talked that she is guilty for the death of Constantine VII, who was, allegedly, poisoned by her, which had nothing to do with reality.

It is undisputable that she was beautiful women, fair and without sorrow, unprincipled and cynical, ready to every offense to come to an independent authority. Her influence on her husband was absolute. She eliminates all those that could have an impact on it. Since she became empress, ordered all sisters of the emperor to be nuns and get monastic tonsure. The same fate had emperor's mother Helena. 43

Two days before the death of Romanus II, Theophane gave birth to daughter Anna. Fearing of competitors that other women could take her man, she considers to liquidate him and remain independent ruler. In the spring of 863, Romanus II went to hunt in the woods, but returned and barely breathing. Everyone thought it was because of excessive riding. Deadly cramps appeared which was unthinkable for the man with sporting spirit. The majority of citizens of Constantinople believe that the emperor was poisoned before going to hunt, brought from the women of the palace, precisely from Thophane's rooms and that poison was placed in the drink. So or either way, Romanus II died on 15 March 963⁴⁴, and because of age of his sons, Theophane headed the state⁴⁵. Military commander Nicephorus thought that political opponents should be blamed for death of Romanus, primarily Joseph.

Soon after the military declared Niciphorus for emperor he entered Constantinople. On August 16, Nicephorus was crowned for emperor, and give promise to protect minor emperors. Soon, Nicephorus feel in love with the young empress and married her, 20 September 963⁴⁶.

Nicephorus had not control his wife, and she planned better future for her and her children. Thophane decided to find replacement for Phocas at the imperial throne. She let rumors that Nicephorus wants to blind Basil and Constantine and does not want to share the power with them. Thus she has kept the attention to John Tzimiskes and started secret correspondence with him. So, Tzimiskes became the last love of Theophane. Conspirators with help from Theophane killed Nicephorus at the night on 10 December 969. Then the army declared John Tzimiskes for emperor⁴⁷.

When Tzimiskes wanted to be crowned for emperor by patriarch, the patriarch has places two conditions. First to find and punish the killers of Nicephorus and secondly to expel Theophane from the palace. So the Theophane's political career ended.

The last ones from the series of rulers from the Macedonian dynasty were empresses Zoe (1042-1050) and Theodora (1042-1056)⁴⁸. Their rule also shows that the voice of women in the Byzantine court was heard and respected.

These examples shows that women in Byzantine were not silent but they ordered, commanded the army, decide for election of the patriarch and so on. These are examples of royal families; unfortunately, we do not have enough data about the situation with ordinary women, but also do not have space to be cover here. However, the canonical provisions was respected only by ordinary women in the presence of their husbands in the church, but outside the church the voice of women was heard and that they were condemned to silence could not be accepted.

¹ Свето Писмо (Библија). Скопје 1990, 221.(Sveto Pismo (Biblija). Skopje 1990, 221). ² Ibid, 221.

³ РС 87, 4061С-4064А, Спореди и: Жан-Клод Шене, Бернар Флизен, Византија -Историја и цивилизација. CLIO, Београд 2010, 243.(Zan-Klod Shane, Bernar Flizen, Vizantija, Istorija i civilizacija. CLIO, Beograd 2010, 243)

⁴ Острогорски Г., Историја Византије. Београд 1969, стр. 83 (Ostrogorski G., Istorija Vizantije. Веоgrad 1969, str. 83); История Византийских императоров. I том. Москва, 2012, стр. 427;(Istorija Vizantijskih imperatorov. I tom, Moskva 2012, str.247); Norič Dž. Dž., Vizantija rani vekovi. Beograd 2009, 166.

⁵ История Византийских императоров. I том. Стр. 427.

⁶ История Византийских императоров. I том. Стр. 428; Кулаковский Ю. А., История Византии. Т. 1. Санкт Петербург, 2003, стр. 393, 394, 395.(Kulakovski J. A; Istorija Vizantii. T. 1, Sankt Peterburg, 2003, str. 393-395)

⁷ История Византийских императоров, II том, стр.31 (Istorija Vizantijskih imperatorov, II tom, str.31).

⁸ Успенски Ф. И., История Византийской империи. Т. 1 Москва,1948, стр.530. (Uspenski F. I., Istorija Vizantijskoj imperii. Т. 1,Moskva,1948, str. 530)

⁹ Дил Ш., Юстиниян и византийская цивилизация во VI век., стр.57.(Dil Sh., Justinijan i vizantijskaja civilizacija vo VI vek. Str.57); История Византийских императоров, II, 32.

¹⁰ Procopii Caesariensis, De bello Persikum. I. Lipsiae 1906, 24, р.123-134; Подбрани извори за историята на Византия. Под Редакция на Ангелов Д., София, 1956, стр.54; Прокопий Кесарийский, Война с персами. Книга I, гл. XIV, стр.79 (Prokopij Kesarijskij, Vojna s persami. Kniga I, gl. XIV, str. 79); Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т.1. Београд 2000, 351 (Uspenski F., Istorija vizantijskog carstva. Т.1, Веоgrad 2000, 351); Жан-Клод Шене, Бернар Флизен, Византија -Историја и цивилизација. Стр.60; Norič Dž. Dž., Vizantija rani vekovi, 180.

¹¹ История Византийских императоров. 3 том, 82;

¹² Nikephoros,ed. De Boor,para. 88; tr. Mango,163; Judith Herrin, Women in purple. Weidenfeld & Nicolson, London 2001, 51.

¹³ Феофан Византиец, Летопись от Диоклетиана до царей Михаила и сына его Феофилакта, стр. 390-392 (Feofan Vizantiec, Letopis ot Diokletiana do carej Mihaila i sina едо Feofilakta, str. 390-392); История Византийских императоров, 82; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 703.

¹⁴ Феофан Византиец, Летопись от Диоклетиана до царей Михаила и сына его Феофилакта, стр. 392; История Византийских императоров, 87. Сf.: Остроумов М.А., Догматическое значение Седьмого Вселенского Сабора; Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори. Превод и поговор Мира Лалић, Београд 2009. стр. 528 (Kartashov A. V., Vaseljenski Sabori. Prevod i pogovor Mira Lalic, Beograd 2009, str. 528).

¹⁵ Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори, 528.

¹⁶ Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 704.

¹⁷ Mansi, XII, 986D-990В; Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори, 529; Послание Адриана, святейшего папы древнего Рима к Константинопольскому патриарху Тарасию. "ДВС", Т. 4, стр.482. Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 84-85; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 704.

¹⁸ Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори , 534; Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 86-87; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 707.

¹⁹ Mansi, XII, 991-1154, and XIII, 1-486; Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 88; Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори, 535, 537; Асмус Валентин, протоиерей, Седьмий Вселенский Собор 787 г., и власть императора в церкви, 52 (Asmus Valentin, protoierej, Sedmij Vselenskij Sobor 787 g., i vlast imperatora v cerkvi, 52).

²⁰ «Благочестивейшим государям и светлейшим императорам и победоносцам, возлюбленнейшим в Бозе и Господе нашем Иисусе Христе чадам, августейшим Константину и Ирине» / «ДВС». Т.4. С.378, 379; Шаф Филип, История християнской Церкви. В 7 т, Т. 4, СПб, 2008, стр. 152-153 (Shaf Filip, Istorija hristijanskoj Cerkvi. V 7 t, T. 4, SPb, 2008, str. 152-1530.

²¹ Феофан Византиец, Летопись от Диоклетиана до царей Михаила и сына его Феофилакта, стр. 390; Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 78-80; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 695.

²² Успенский Ф. И., История Византийской империи. Т. 2, 421; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 718.

²³ Острогорски Г., Историја Византије, 190; Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 121-122; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 719.

²⁴ Theophanes, AM 6294, de Boor I, 475; RFA, a. 802, Lilie, Eirene und Konstantin VI, 210-12; Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 125.

²⁵ История Византийских императоров, 3 том, стр. 115-116; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 731.

²⁶ Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 696; История Византийских императоров, 3 том, стр. 116.

²⁷ Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 99.

²⁸ История Византийских императоров, 3 том, 121; Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори, 547-548; Judith Herrin, Women in purple, 100.

²⁹ Judith Herrin, Women in purple,191.

³⁰ Афинганов Д. Е., Повесть о прощении Феофила и Торжество Православия, стр. 56; История Византийских императоров, 3 том, стр.291-292.

³¹ Продолжатель Феофана, Жизнеописание византийских царей. Кн. III. Глава 5, стр.63.

³² Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори, 569; История Византийских императоров, 3 том, 292; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 811.

³³ Продолжатель Феофана, Жизнеописание византийских царей. Кн., 3 том, 293.

³⁴ Продолжатель Феофана, Жизнеописание византийских царей. Кн. IV, глава 5 и 6, стр. 102 и 103; Карташов А. В., Васељенски Сабори, 571; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 824.

³⁵ Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 1, 833.

³⁶ Продолжатель Феофана, Жизнеописание византийских царей. Кн. V. Гл.9, стр.148.

³⁷ Исто, гл.11, стр. 149; История Византийских императоров, 4 том, стр. 10; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 2, Београд 2000, 13.

³⁸ Продолжатель Феофана, Жизнеописание византийских царей. Кн. V, глава 74 и 75, стр. 198 и 199.

³⁹ История Византийских императоров, 4 том, стр. 10.

⁴⁰ Острогорски Г., Историја Византије, 272.

4141 Дил Ш., Византийские портрети, стр. 148.

⁴² Гиббон Э., Закат и падение Римской империи. Т. 3, стр.365 (Gibbon E., Zakat i padenie Rimskoj imperii. Т. 3, str. 365).

⁴³ Продолжатель Феофана, Жизнеописание византийских царей. Кн. VI,глава 3, стр. 287; Острогорски Г., Историја Византије, 272.

⁴⁴ История Византийских императоров, 4 том, 176.

⁴⁵ Острогорски Г., Историја Византије, 273.

⁴⁶ Исто, 273; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 2, 377.

⁴⁷ Исто,279; История Византийских императоров, 4 том, 203; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 2, 402.

⁴⁸ История Византийских императоров, 4 том, 298-304; Успенски Ф., Историја византијског царства. Т. 2, 495.